

HUMAN TRAFFICKING: RUSSIA AS A COUNTRY OF ORIGIN

Farhad MEHDIYEV

Qafqaz University,
School of Law, Dr.,
Baku / AZERBAIJAN

ABSTRACT

Human trafficking is one of the actual and acute problems of 21 century, because trafficking is a contemporary slavery which appears like shameful phenomenon for modern civilization. At the same time this issue involves many countries as well as organized criminal groups. Russia one of the biggest countries of the world faced with this problem. Russia is a country of origin, transit and destination for human trafficking. Features and reasons of human trafficking from Russia were analyzed in this article. Some proposals and presumable developments of trafficking issue were put forward as well.

Key words. Human trafficking, sexual exploitation, Russian Federation.

Introduction

Young women and cheap workers are trafficked to Europe, USA, Canada, and countries of Africa, Asia and the Middle East. Transnational organizations of human traffickers make a huge profit. This criminal activity involves inside not only young women but also children. Victims of trafficking are subject to different inhuman treatments. Russia is a country which provides near 30 – 60 thousand of contemporary slaves every year.

“Human trafficking is conditioned by the difference in social state of the various sections of the population and also by the difference in level of people’s living in various regions. Looking for a better life and job, people have to leave places of their permanent residence and travel to other regions and countries.”¹

1. New Approach and Perception in Human Rights Violations: Human Trafficking

Trafficking in human being as a criminal offence is a relatively new. For years the

issue was not perceived by institutions because of different reasons. While governments and international organizations paid attention and fought with essential human rights violations, it was not thought that human trafficking could violate – either directly or indirectly – such essential rights like life, liberty, dignity and private life immunity.

Dependent on the legal system of a country, victims of trafficking are subject to such essential human rights violations and associated criminal offences like slavery, involuntary servitude, forced or compulsory labour, unlawful coercion, unlawful threats, extortion, illegal imprisonment, kidnapping, illegal procurement, corruption, debt bondage, document theft, destruction of documents, sexual assault, assault, bodily injury, rape, death, forced marriage, forced abortion, forced pregnancy, torture and even murder.²

Notwithstanding that violators of rights in human trafficking are not public bodies but private parties; wide involvement in human trafficking of organized criminal groups

makes it vulnerable issue for national states because in that way trafficking affects whole society. Different groups, actors and institutions are being affected from trafficking – women, men, child, law enforcement and custom agencies, market, population of country, neighbor states. The list could be prolonged. Corruption whether it is, makes it much more dangerous event than it seems to be.

In result countries with a weak economy and low income face with each-year-increasing human trafficking and this situation jeopardize their social and political situation.

Contemporary human rights theory insists that national states have to adopt relative legislation and implement policy which reduces to minimum conditions for breach of human rights. That's why though public bodies are not main actors in human trafficking, the issue is subject to human rights protection.

1.1. Human trafficking: why it is paid so much attention to it?

Some institutions, like Amnesty International in 2006 report claimed that States misuse "threat of illegal migrants" as well as "threat of terrorism", increase their authorities and press human rights.³

This claim could sound rationale in some cases. But if we take more wide approach, human trafficking issue will appear like spider-web. It involves not only human rights breach but also organized crime, drugs smuggling, other offences like murder and kidnapping, threat to national and regional security, labor market, unlawful competition, lack of confidence to society and law enforcement. Finally, human trafficking in all its appearances in a gross contrary to grounds of democracy. As it said in UNODC report, virtually no country in the world is unaffected by the crime of human

trafficking for sexual exploitation or forced labour.

It is known that origin countries relatively undeveloped and poor countries. At the same time human rights and democracy records of these countries usually low and poor. That's why source countries usually compelled by international organizations and countries with high level of democracy. In example of US and EU, it is possible to say that these institutions care about illegal trafficking not only because it violates human rights but also threaten their economy, demographic system thus their interests and security.

Tightening visa regime in most cases results that ordinary citizens experience problems in free movement. Criminals usually find loops in legislation or breach it by falsifying documents.

Not all questions and troubles are resolved. But it doesn't mean that nothing should be done. In contrary, countries should work hardly on issue to provide and assert human rights. Cooperation and exchange of information are essential. Understanding the depth, breadth and scope of trafficking can help us to design policies to fight it.⁴ Preamble of Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons enlightens the abovementioned prerogatives.

The recent decision of PA of OSCE which calls that combat with human trafficking should be increased without restriction of freedom of movement is very important and meaningful. It is certain that efforts in fight with trafficking have to more productive. There is some work as for governments as well as for non-government groups to reduce the slavery of 21 century.

In fact human trafficking in forms of sexual exploitation and forced labour exists for decades. Prostitution existed and will exist for always. Cheap labour force (workers) as

well. Firstly the problem appeared only as issue of economic and social well-being. But after globalization, transparency of borders, appearance of gross illegal migration flows and involvement of organized criminal groups, cares about providing of economic and social rights, the problem became actually very wide, deep and serious. This is the main reasons why western democracies spend so much effort to fight trafficking.

1.2. Appearances of human trafficking

Appearances of trafficking in persons showed in article 3 of Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons. We can underline such common kinds of trafficking like;

Sexual exploitation of women: the most common type of trafficking. Victims are lured or deceived in origin country, after arrival in destination country they are deprived from their ID's, threaten, beaten, kept locked and forced to provide sexual services. Sexual exploitation of women can merge forced labour, if no external consent of victim.

Sexual exploitation of children: use and exploitation of children in providing of sexual services and making pornography. This kind of trafficking doesn't need in using threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability.

Forced labour: use of cheap labour by threat or use of force or superior position, briefly means which are counted in article 3 paragraph a of abovementioned Protocol.

Trade of human organs: removal of organs by threat or use of force, or deception, or misuse of victim's position of social or other vulnerability.

Issue of victim's consent: doesn't affect crime in children trafficking. In other kinds

of trafficking, consent of victim isn't important if victim in any serious dependence from traffickers or experiences the grievous life conditions.

Intention of exploitation: necessary for trafficking crimes. So there is no trafficking crime when parents sell their child for adoption.

Some appearances of trafficking constitute other crimes at the same time, like involvement in prostitution, sexual abuse, sexual exploitation of children, organizing of prostitution, commitment of grievous injury, torture etc. But some of its kinds are punishable only under trafficking charge, like employment for a miserable salary with depriving him/her from documents thus preventing from leaving workplace.

Here we could mention that some kinds of trafficking are not considered by wide public as trafficking and their victims aren't accepted as victim. These are some cases of forced labour and prostitution. For instance, where employer pays miserable salary to workers who have no choice but work for the employer, this trafficking crime actually aren't accepted as crime by wide public in CIS countries, because of common implementation. At the other hand, exploited prostitutes are not considered as "victims" if they knew about possibility to be exploited before.⁵

2. Origin and Destination of Human Trafficking Process

Here we are going to analyze, in general and in particular, where trafficking comes from and where it takes a way.

Economic and social factors, as well as corrupted governance are the main factors which affect and create a trafficking process. This is a flow of population, from economically poor geography to more developed societies. Trafficking could be observed

even within one jurisdiction, as we can see it in Russia. Moscow and St.Petersburg much more developed, salaries are higher. That's why Russian citizens who live in countryside migrates in central cities for a better life as well as citizens of CIS countries.

Developed countries of Europe, USA, Canada, Japan are the most attractive countries for a people, who live in poor conditions or wish better life. Not all migrants are starving or unemployed or homeless in their home country. Western values, high standards of life, high salaries, fantasies about better life push people toward migration in destination countries. But level of attractiveness for migration is not an main index of trafficking but possibilities and environment for exploitation. Ten countries in the Trafficking Database score very high as reported destinations for trafficked victims. Five of these countries are in Western Europe: Belgium, Germany, Greece, Italy and the Netherlands. Among Asian countries Israel and Turkey have a very high score; Japan; Thailand. The other very highly reported destination country is the United States.

In fact, sometimes victims of trafficking know about their future exploitation by traffickers, but by different reasons they are involving in trafficking with consent.⁶ For prostitutes from CIS countries, trading by pimp in Italy or France might be seen as adventure and luxury life if she gains only 10-20 USD for a client in home country.

2.1. Main source and destination countries

The last report of UNODC shows 10 countries as country of destination with a *very high* score and 21 countries with a *high* score. Between countries with a *high* score of exploitation like Poland, Kosovo, Cambodia and Pakistan are not well-developed countries. Thus we could say

that every country which provides conditions for exploitation is a subject to being destination country.

Between source countries, Belarus, the Republic of Moldova, the Russian Federation and Ukraine (Commonwealth of Independent States); Albania, Bulgaria, Lithuania and Romania (Central and South Eastern Europe); China, Thailand and Nigeria have a very high rank as a country of origin. Armenia, Georgia, Kazakhstan, and Uzbekistan (Commonwealth of Independent States); Czech Republic, Estonia, Hungary, Latvia, Poland and Slovakia (Central and South Eastern Europe); Bangladesh, India, Nepal and Pakistan (South Central Asia); Cambodia, Lao PDR, Myanmar, the Philippines and Viet Nam (South-Eastern Asia); Benin, Ghana and Morocco (Africa); Brazil, Colombia, Dominican Republic, Guatemala and Mexico (Latin America and the Caribbean) have a high rank of being country of origin.

Albania, Russia, Belarus, Ukraine, Bulgaria usually provide sex slaves. Some countries of origin countries provide sex slaves as well as cheap labour. Countries Nepal, Vietnam and Pakistan usually provide labour migrants. For Central and Eastern Europe countries, the main reason of being source for sex slaves is that tall white-skin and handsome women of that region are very demandable all over the world.⁷

2.2. Source and destination: distinctions and impacts

Some countries appear as country of origin as well as country of destination. Like Russia, Thailand and China. Russia "exports" sexual slaves and import as sexual slaves from CIS countries as well as labour slaves from more wide geography, like CIS countries, China and Vietnam. In hotels of Moscow Vietnam prostitutes are usual deal.

Woman trafficking is widespread within China (from poor northern regions to richer south); Chinese women and children are sold in Japan, Korea and Australia as well.⁸ At the same time Chinese consumers manage to buy sexual service from Russia, Russian girl become more and more popular for rich Chinese businessmen.

What is threat of human trafficking for source country and what are these for destination country? Are there any profits?

Profits from human trafficking, in case of forced labour could be a low price of production, more competing economy and relevant economic growth. No hypothetical profit for destination country exists in case of sexual trafficking. Source country in case of sexual exploitation suffers as well – there are no contribution to economy and following demographic destruction.

But in fact uncontrolled and illegal migration creates or can create a big threat for destination country. Illegal migration creates trafficking by itself – illegal status of migrant gives a chance for criminals to exploit them in different areas and with different specifications. Thus, illegal migration causes increasing of criminal activity, breach of competitive market, destroying of respect to human right and civil society. Increasing of criminal activity isn't limited with organized and trafficking crimes, but also causes to the use victims of trafficking in smuggling, terrorism and many other crimes.⁹

Thus, trafficking creates a real threat mainly for destination country.

2.3. Russia in human trafficking chain

As we mentioned above, Russia appears to be as country of origin as well as country of destination. From European point of view, Russia is important as a country of origin and as a transit country. Asian migrants,

women from China, Vietnam, former Soviet republics like Ukraine, Moldova and Central Asian republics are trafficked to Europe through Russia. Russian women and children are trafficked to very wide geography in the world, the serious numbers were sent in Belgium, Spain, Germany, Netherlands, Scandinavia, United States, Turkey, Greece, Arab Emirates, Israel, Egypt, China, Korea and Japan.¹⁰ In some countries being with Russian woman is considered like some kind of prestige and prosperity. The number of Russian women trafficked is estimated as 35 – 60 thousand every year.¹¹ Trafficking (slave trade) from Russia usually means providing of prostitutes and non-adults girls.¹²

We can positively say that Russia plays very important and essential role in human trafficking chain. If we talk about sexual exploitation, Russia has the one of the first rank as origin country. If we talk about forced labour, Russia has a very high rank as destination country for migrant from CIS and Asia counties.¹³ Wide geography and enormous size of country makes it inevitable for transit issues.

According data provided by the Ministry of Internal Affairs of RF (Russian Federation), every year 12 million illegal migrants enter in Russia.¹⁴ Some of them stay in Russia, the rest leave it for a different destination.

Thus, combating human trafficking and issues of illegal migration in Russia is very important as for global community as for Russia. Because of demographic situation Europe has to accept some amount of migrants from time to time. Asians and Africans become more and more usual in European cities. It is all about globalization, but is the contemporary world ready to erase borders and national identities? My personal opinion is that it would be better if Europe accepted migrants from

Russia but not from Asia and Africa. But demographic situation in Russia is not better than in Europe, growth of Slavic and domestic population is getting fewer with every year. Birth rate of Russia is one of the lowest in the world – 9.8%.¹⁵ During last fifteen years population got reduced from 148,7 million (in 1992) to 142 million. It is said that at the half of century with a current demographic growth population will constitute only half of current amount (70 million).

Demand creates and leads the problem. There is demand in European market. Demand for sexual services, demand for adoption, demand for cheap labour. Until the demand exists, Russia with current social and economic rank will show up as a country of origin. As Director of UNODC Antonio Costa said, one of three main objectives for combating trafficking is a reducing of demand.¹⁶ But until employing of cheap labour or using of sexual services of prostitutes doesn't create criminal or other serious liability, it will be impossible to reduce demand in countries of destination. In Sweden sexual relation with a prostitute is punishable with a fine. But it might be seen as intervention to private life if intercourse with payment was prosecuted as offence, until there is no exploitation of prostitute.

3. Russia as the Country of Origin

Pattern of origin countries in human trafficking is very meaningful, it explains us that if we talk about trafficking for sexual exploitation, Russia with current index of unemployment and organized crime, weak family institute probably will be country of origin for sexual slaves and children trafficking.

Russian women and children are trafficked by 4 main routes: "Baltic route" – to Germany with subsequent transportation

to EU countries and US. Second route is "Caucasian route" – through Georgia to Turkey, Greece and Italy. Third route is "middle east" route – to Egypt, UAE and Israel. The last route is "Chinese route" – from Siberia and Primorye to China, Thailand and Japan.¹⁷

Index of organized criminal activity of Russia is very high. Experts say that for a first half of 2007 there are about 10 thousands organized criminal groups with total number of members as 300 thousand.¹⁸ Official statistic of Ministry of Interior shows that there are 450 organized criminal groups in Russia with total number of members 12 thousand, involved in murder, kidnapping, burglary, blackmail, drug and human trafficking.

For a country with 142 million of population, such index is really very high. And still there is no special effective state program for combating trafficking.¹⁹ As Russian Minister of Interior confessed, the struggle against organized crime in Russia is still very weak. In such circumstances organized criminal groups positively are involved in trafficking process, mostly being organizers of such process.

Child pornography is also very widespread in Russia. More than half of all internet based child porno movies are Russian.²⁰

International and domestic observers underline some reasons of trafficking in Russia.²¹ Such reasons are:

- relatively transparent state borders between Russia and CIS countries;
- increase in migration outside and inside Russia;
- low standards of life in comparison with western countries;
- internal human trafficking within Russia. Especially from East to West and from CIS countries as one of the spheres of

criminal business, including use of forced labour;

- globalization of the organized crime, existence of the stable channels of "deliveries". Thus Russia is considered to be a country of origin, transit and destination.

3.1. Russia's demographic features

As we mentioned above, demographic situation in Russia keeps critic level. Russian Minister stated with a big hope that reducing of population in 2007 constituted 269.100 of population and this number lesser in comparison with 2006.²² In 2006 relevant amount of reduced population constituted as 689.500.²³ The problem is very acute for Russia, that's why government of RF had to examine this problem on the special meeting of RF Security Council in June 2006. Special decree and law was promulgated after above-mentioned meeting. Money compensation and different type of supports were considered for families and mothers in general.

Russia has a very weak family institute. Rank of divorces keeps very high level amongst other countries – 6 divorces for 1000 number of population for 2002.²⁴ The index of divorces was very high for 2006 as well, Russia kept first rank, more than Belorussia and USA.²⁵ 600 families from 1000 get to divorce.²⁶ Majority of families prefer to have only one child, they consist about 70% of families – near 14 million families. Every year 400.000 children are born by unmarried women, it is about 30% of all newborn babies. Official number of children without parents constituted 720.000 for 2005. But governor of Kemerovskaya District expressed to President Putin that real number of homeless minors is between 2 – 5 million. In 2004 64.000 kids were registered whose parents were deprived from parenthood.²⁷

The number of females is more than number of males. Only in Moscow the difference is about 500 thousand for 2004 (total population is 10.5 million).²⁸ It's a huge misbalance. Other regions of Russia don't show better proportion. Approximate proportion of males/females in Russia is 46,8 to 53,2. This difference is enormous and badly affects demographic situation in the country. No other country in the world with the same index.²⁹

As we mentioned above, Russian government tries to take some efforts to improve the situation. But these efforts are very new and did not success yet. But it is obvious that contemporary demographic issues of Russia boost trafficking. In society where is no strong family institute, the big number of women without marriage, unemployed, give birth to baby and try to grow up without any support, prostitution and trafficking is very expectable. The big number of orphans and careless children provoke the trafficking as well.

3.2. Social factors which increase trafficking

After demographic reasons, social factors are the most affecting the trafficking. First of them is a low level of income. Uncompetitive economy, high level of prices for consumer products, unemployment, absence of believe in accomplished life and personal happiness also cause the trafficking process. In one of cases, alcohol addicted mother tried to trade her 3-months daughter just for 80 rubles (4 USD).³⁰ The material changes in living standards, the psychological changes and attitudes of people, especially women, and the belief in a utopia in Western countries, have caused many women to seek ways to migrate for work or emigrate permanently. Trafficking in women and girls is caused by the compounding factors of economic collapse

and unemployment, the decreasing social status of women in the transition to a market economy. In 2000, almost 60 million Russians, over 40 per cent of the population, lived below the poverty line or subsistence level and some 80 million adults spent half their income on basic food staples.³¹

Officially there are 5 millions of unemployed in Russia³². State support for unemployed citizens very low – from 720 rubles (27 USD) up to 2880 rubles (110 USD), thus average is about 70-80 USD. For Russia with relatively high prices for food and other stuff, this support is not adequate and can't provide even minimum life standards.

1999	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007
6937,6	7059,1	6287,9	6154,7	5683,3	5775,2	5208,3	4998,7	4378

Approximate number of unemployed persons in Russian Federation³³

The percentage of women in unemployment is very high – about 70%.³⁴ In some region the level on unemployed women are higher, like in Tatarstan – it is about 85% of unemployed.³⁵ Unemployment fasters prostitution also within Russia. Official data of Ministry of Interior shows that there are 150.000 registered prostitutes in country.³⁶ But statistics of UN says that only in Moscow about 80.000-130.000 prostitutes. Sex traders in Moscow are residents of CIS countries and other regions of Russia. In Kazan – single-mothers and unemployed women, in Tomsk – female students of universities.³⁷

Unemployment with addition of organized crime creates a condition for early-aged

prostitution. Experts estimate that 70 per cent of prostitutes in Russia enter prostitution at the age of 14-16 and that encouragement of minor girls from rural areas or provincial towns and of young girls with learning difficulties into the sex industry is a growing trend. Russian Federation Border Guards officials reported that there were many under aged children, the majority of them girls, being trafficked abroad using false documents. Other factor facilitates prostitution is that sexual relations are not phenomenon under taboo; sexual relations for minors in 14 is not something immoral or unusual. That's why the demand for sexual services finds quick response at potential "service providers". In environment of poverty, some of young girls manage to trade their attractiveness for money, being turned into swamp of prostitution.

About 4 million of minors are homeless, without parental patronage or involved in forced labour, beggary, drug trafficking or prostitution. All of them are vulnerable to exploitation and potential victims of trafficking. Many girls in orphanage are going to join to sexual industry after orphanage just because they don't have social protection as to get proper work or start education in college.³⁸

Finally we should underline that moral values in Russian society are really very vague. Soviet ideology had it own morality. It excluded Christian moral values and erased them. After collapsing of USSR, some religious values came to life again, but they are weak and these values don't work neither in fighting criminality nor in combating bad social behaviors. Thus the difference between being clerk of chief or provide him sexual services at the same time is not a big for contemporary Russian mentality.

But social difficulties make their way. Sad experience of victims of trafficking seems to be insufficient lesson for other potential victims. Opinion poll carried out in city Krasnodar shows that two of thirds of schoolgirls and students plan to go abroad for any employment after graduation; even there is a pre-informed risk of being sex or labour slaves. Sociologists state that the number of potential and conscious trafficking victims willing to leave for EU or USA is over 800 thousand in the Krasnodar region.³⁹

3.3. Corruption and organized criminal groups in trafficking

While unemployment, poverty and poor life standards are just grounds for trafficking, organized criminal activity is the main creator of trafficking. Trafficking in human being is one of varieties of organized crime. Because trafficking exists where exploitation of victims exists; exploitation network in turn needs in organized activity of criminals, involved in recruitment, transportation, harboring, selling of victims. We can definitely say that if there is no organized criminal activity there will not any exploitation and thus, trafficking activity. The prostitution and cheap or illegal labour exist for always; the problem raise where such activities are lead by illegal groups aimed material benefit. The problem doesn't rise as only an issue of infringement of human rights, but also as a widespread criminality involves corruption, drugs smuggling, terrorism (recruitment of militants), and falsification of documents, clandestine border-crossing and other illegal activities.

The mechanism of recruitment by criminal group works very easy. Women are being invited for luring work, but she has to pay money for visa, transportation and other expenses, which constitutes about 2.000 –

5.000 euro. Usually potential victims don't have that money. Then traffickers offer them that travel company or jobfinder agency is paying for her expenses, but after victim has to pay back when s/he starts to work. Documents of victims usually are confiscated just after arrival to destination country. S/he will get them back when debt is paid back. In brothel or bar where victims usually are exploited they are subject to violence, grieve fines and moral terror.⁴⁰

Human trafficking is a high profitable activity, very profitable after such crimes like drugs and weapon smuggling. That's why criminal groups couldn't stay away from trafficking opportunities. For trafficking of a prostitute in countries like UAE it is paid about 7.000 – 10.000 USD, in Turkey and Israel 2.000 – 3.000 USD. Trafficking of children for adoption is more profitable. In case of company "Unona" which traded children to US from Russia, Ukraine, Kazakhstan, Guatemala and some other countries, illegal organized group claimed price rom 10.000 USD to 20.000 USD per child trafficked.⁴¹

Huge benefits are made by "buyers" of victims rather than dealers. Depending on country of destination, daily one prostitute could be exploited for up to 3000 euro. In UAE, payment for one sexual service with woman from CIS region varies from 600 to 1000 dirham (from 120 to 250 USD). In Finland payment for one night more than 250 euro.⁴²

Corruption is also accelerated trafficking. In 2006 Sverdlov District Court convinced an organized criminal group consisted from 5 members, one of them was former police officer and other was a 52 years-old teacher in public high-school, they traded male minors in Ekaterinburg. Prosecution could prove charges over 113 crimes, but claimed that more than 1000 minors suffered from this group which traded, made child

pornography and trafficked children.⁴³ Also in case of "Yunona" traffickers bought information from officials of child shelters. Corruption on borders makes it easier to cross the frontiers with false documents or with serious suspicions or evidences of trafficking. Representative one of travel agencies confessed that when they need to get the visa for woman trafficked to UAE, they overpay "100 USD for a visa to certain officials of immigration office of UAE and deal is done"⁴⁴.

Victims are trafficked by using travel companies, dating, model or jobfinding agencies. Official license should be issued by state body for this kind of business. The international agencies call government of RF and other CIS countries to tighten the condition of granting licenses for preventing possible criminals from trafficking.

Russia adopted in criminal legislation crimes related with human trafficking in 2003. But number of cases with accusation on human trafficking is very low (about 88 cases for 2005 and the similar number for 2006).⁴⁵ Officials say that 5 or 6 years should pass and relevant practice should settle before new articles of Criminal Code 127-1 and 127-2 will productively work.⁴⁶ High ranked official of Ministry of Interior stated that trafficking crimes are hard-investigated, victims usually prefer to keep silence or have no proof of exploitation. But other articles of Criminal Code, like "involving in prostitution" (art.240), "organization of prostitution" (art.241), "illegal distribution of pornography" (art.242), and "producing and turnover of child pornography" (art.242-1) were more applied (subsequently – 257, 1033, 2114, 60). These criminal offences were performed within country.

Officials say that commitment of these crimes seriously increased from 2000 to 2005; involving in prostitution – increased

11,5 times (from 34 to 390), organization of prostitution – 7,2 times (from 145 to 1039), illegal distribution of pornography – 6 times (361-2164).⁴⁷

The other reason why it is difficult to combat with organized criminal groups involved in trafficking is that these groups usually are not big in size. No group was seized in Russia in accusation with human trafficking with a member number more than 20. Without counting of "offshore" members of conspiracy, usually these groups within Russia have up to 10 members. Here we are talking about groups which recruit and transport victims over border.

Very big Russian criminal syndicates like "Solnsevskoye", "Izmailovskoye", "Domodedovskoye", "Podolskoye" don't involve in human trafficking as dealers but buyers of victims.⁴⁸ Casinos, restaurants and brothels which belong to members of these syndicates usually use the labour and services of victims of trafficking. It is unknown exactly how many and where in the world these syndicates have a point of consumptions, but casinos in Las Vegas which belong to Russian mafia, positively employ Russian hostess as cheap labour and sexual service providers. FBI data for 2006 shows that there are 8.000 forced to prostitutions from Slavic republics of former USSR and also 3.000 criminals who involved in sexual exploitation. FBI says that "Solnsevskoye", "Izmailovskoye", "Dagestanskaya", "Kazanskaya" syndicates function on the whole territory of US.⁴⁹

Though organized criminal group is vital in trafficking, in fact existing of group doesn't cause to illegal migration itself. Demand for sexual services and cheap labour as well as hard life conditions the main grounds of trafficking. Organized criminal groups speed it up and appear to be necessary chain in exploitation process.

3.4. Insufficiency of means in combat with human trafficking

What are the factors of weak struggle with trafficking?

In addition to grounds of creating and facilitating trafficking process some additional factors make it hard to fight with illegal exploitation.

The first reason is an absence of information at potential victims of trafficking. Actually some of victims would accept to be trafficked even if they knew about the exploitation. But huge number of victims wouldn't let to be exploited. How potential victims could be informed? Schools and mass media don't seem to be sufficient mean, because near half of the potential victims neither go to school nor pay attention to mass media. From the other side once student graduated from high-school afterwards wasn't accepted to college or university, s/he cannot be educated. But anyway it should be tried – in high-schools when children get their 13 – 14 years old, special courses should be introduced. Public should be aware with bill-boards about risk of exploitation overseas.

The second reason is that trafficking victims uninformed about general status of foreigners in destination country. They are threatened that in case of escape police will punish them severely, that illegal work or prostitution is criminally punishable conduct. By this fraud traffickers manage to keep away victims from police. Also traffickers use different means of violence. Sometime they beat victims, sometimes make them drug or alcohol addicted, sometimes threat with use of violence toward family member of victims in home country.

The third reason of insufficiency is that custom and border officials are not well-

prepared and trained for prevention of trafficking. Using of biometric system of identification and technical equipment on borders which able to trace all foreign trips and travels of persons could help custom and border officials figure out victims of trafficking.

We also could mention that Russians like to travel all around the world. In comparison with other CIS countries, number of Russian tourists actually is more. It is an additional reason why tracing and surveillance of persons who travel overseas have some difficulties.

Mass media also claims that government is reluctant in solving the problems of trafficking. Very serious newspaper "Kommersant" in article published in 16.03.2006 criticized Minister of Interior and Chief Deputy of Federal Migration Service accusing them that they don't want to find out the reasons of migration and don't have a real intention to combat illegal migration.⁵⁰ We can see such kind of allegations by international organizations or other countries as well.

But these accusations seem to be wrong. Russia is a huge state, it has it's own interests and problems. Russia is a country with hundreds nationalities within its border. Also in spite of collapsing USSR, RF is not willing to lose all ties with former Soviet republics. And Russia is not going to prohibit an entry, residence or employment of CIS countries residents in Russia. And huge amount of migrants from CIS countries are good mean of patronage and control. For instance, in case if criminal escapes in Russia, Azerbaijani law enforcement bodies have to cooperate with relative Russian institution, request information, ask for arrest and extradition because they really need in information about Azerbaijani citizens and help of Russian side. As we analyzed above,

problems of trafficking and illegal migration are affected from different factors. Russian government tries to control the problem, but the final solution is really very difficult and depends on many circumstances. Legislation of RF on punishment of human trafficking is very severe – in case if trafficking crimes is committed by organized group – the punishment is imprisonment from 8 years up to 15 years (according articles 127.1 and 127.2 of Criminal Code of RF). Relevant Russian law enforcement bodies never abstain from cooperation with foreign anti-trafficking institutions. Thus, accusation that Russian government is reluctant to fight trafficking is unsubstantial.

4. Conclusion

The situation on trafficking issues in Russia positively can be improved. It will be very difficult to remove trafficking at all, but it is possible to reduce. There are some recommendation by NGOs and international organizations like IOM or ILO. It is recommended to widen a relevant education of potential victims, tighten control over travel, dating, model and job agencies, improve social conditions of potential victims, strength family institute, and increase an international cooperation with anti-trafficking bodies of other countries.

But two significant tasks should be done certainly; first of them – reduce the demand in destination countries.⁵¹ The second objective is to improve social conditions in Russia, which seems to be very difficult as well. What could be done with huge army (about 4 or 5 millions) of homeless children? Organized criminal groups could be defeated in case of strong surveillance and international cooperation and data exchange. But if people live in bad conditions they will try go overseas and find a better conditions of life and thus they could get trapped in exploitation.

That's why reducing demand also very important. How it could be performed?

In destination countries the use of illegal migrants as workers should cause to serious liability. Sanctions should be very serious. These sanctions should be directed to traffickers but not to victims (illegal workers or prostitutes).

New ID cards or passport with electronic chips should be implemented. These ID cards should be used as payment mean. Different kind of data could be collected on the chip, law enforcement agencies should have an access to read relevant data like dates of entry and living country etc. Tracing these data will let anti-trafficking bodies to determine whether exploitation could take place. It could be considered like intervention to private life, but it seems to be the only way to control potential victims of trafficking.

The amount of potential victims of trafficking in Russia is very significant – more than 5 million. Most of them unemployed women age of up to 29 years old and homeless or orphan children. Thus, situation is very urgent and all efforts should be done to secure both countries of origin and destination from totally unaccepted manifestation of contemporary slavery and evil crime like trafficking.

LITERATURE

1. Elena Mizulina, "Trafficking in Persons in Russia: international and legal aspects", Moscow, "Lawyer" 2006, p.10
2. United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC), Trafficking in Persons: Global Patterns, April 2006 s.63
3. http://wek.ru/articles/politic/politika_i_politiki_strakha/index.shtml/print
4. Antonio Maria Costa, Foreword of 2006 Report of UNODC "Trafficking in Persons: Global Patterns"
5. Lopashenko, N.A, "Countermeasures against contemporary infringement to right of freedom", [http://sartracc.sgap.ru/Pub/lopashenko\(30-10-06\).htm#_ftnref2](http://sartracc.sgap.ru/Pub/lopashenko(30-10-06).htm#_ftnref2)

6. Aleksey Olshanskiy, Yuriy Kochemin, *Contemporary Slave*, 21.06.2007, "Noviye Izvestiya", <http://www.newizv.ru/news/2007-06-21/71366/>
7. <http://kiev-security.org.ua/box/4/98.shtml>
8. <http://kiev-security.org.ua/box/4/99.shtml>
9. <http://gzt.ru/politics/2006/03/15/215006.html>
10. Combating trafficking in women and children for sexual exploitation, Counter trafficking protocol and plan of action for the Russian Federation, the Angel Coalition, Moscow 2004, p.1
11. Alexandr Bezlepkin, Leaders in making Child porno, Profil, 20 March 2006, <http://www.undp.ru/index.phtml?iso=RU&lid=2&pid=2&cmd=text&id=145>
12. Rossiyskaya Gazeta, *Trade on Live Goods*, 2.03.2005.
13. Louise Shelley, *Exploitation could involve every member of society*, <http://ukon.su/guests/9616.html>
14. Anton Ivanitskiy, Oleg Rubinkovich, Nadejda Kevorkova, "Russia provides at highest 5 score, but exploits for 3." "Gazeta" No 73, 26.04.2006.
15. Oleg Platonov, *On situation of Russian Nation*, <http://pravds.narod.ru/mayak/2005/3/3.htm>
16. Antonio Maria Costa, *ibidem*.
17. *Export flow. Russia became one of the center of human trafficking*, <http://newssamara.ru/news/83677/>
18. Special report of Minister of Interior Rashid Nurgaliyev on index of crime in Russia, 13 March 2007. <http://www.newizv.ru/news/2007-03-14/65392/>
19. Official statistic of Ministry of Interior for 2005, <http://www.mvd.rupress/release/4165/4165>. In fact, there are 2 programs in combating trafficking – the first was adopted in February 2005 by presidents of CIS countries "Program on cooperation against fight with trafficking for 2007-2010", and the second is joint-program of IOM – Ministry of Interior of RF "Preventing human trafficking in Russia for 2006-2008".
20. *Meeting was held in Ministry of Interior of RF on combating human trafficking*, <http://www.parlcom.ru/index.php?p=MC83>
21. Elena Mizulina, "Trafficking in Persons in Russia: international and legal aspects", Moscow, "Lawyer" 2006, p.11.
22. Statement of Minister of Regional Development Vladimir Dedukhin in 7 September 2007. <http://news.chelni.ru/index.php?id=13969>
23. Official report of Ministry of Health of RF, http://www.mzsrrf.ru/analit_inform/611.html
24. Vishnevskiy A.G., *Population of Russia 2002, 10th Annual Demographic Report*, Moscow 2004, p..38
25. <http://www.tvzvezda.ru/?id=88489>
26. Dobrenkov V.I, Kravchenko A.I, *Sociology: Book3. Social Institutes and Processes*, Chapter 7.
27. Ekaterina Lakhova, statement on hearings of Duma's Comitee on Women, Chidlren and Family, 04.12.2005.
28. <http://www.mgodeloros.ru/off-line/moskva.doc>
29. Medkov V.M., *Demography*, Feniks, Rostov-na-Donu, 2002, s.172.
30. Ekaterina Kudashkina, *Country of Slaves*, Vedomosti, 17.03.2006. No:46 (1573)
31. Donna M. Hughes, *Trafficking for Sexual Exploitation: The Case of the Russian Federation*, IOM Migration Research Series No:7, June 2002, p.9
32. Vladimir Dedukhin, *ibidem*.
33. http://www.gks.ru/free_doc/2007/b07_11/06-08.htm
34. Zakirova V.M., Will Russian family survive in environment of gender conflict? <http://www.irex.ru/press/pub/polemika/14/zak/>.
35. Donna M.Hughes, p.10.
36. <http://www.newsru.com/russia/16mar2006/traffick.html>
37. <http://crynews.ru/info/1942.html>
38. Elena Turukanova, *Territory out of law*, <http://crynews.ru/info/1942.html>
39. *Girls usually come across tempting ads in newspapers promising up to two thousands of dollars a month*, <http://english.pravda.ru/society/stories/7977-0/>
40. Tatyana Shikerayeva, *Forced to be night-moth*, <http://www.versii.com/telegraf/material.php?id=1859&nomer=201>
41. Anastasiya Makrashina, *Russian kids traded wholesale*, 24.01.2006, *Gazeta*, http://gazeta.ru/2006/01/24/oa_185795.shtml
42. That's why sometimes Finn males prefer to cross border, come in Russia and buy sexual services just for 20-50 euros in towns of North-West Russia.
43. Arseniy Vaganov, *Market of pedophiles*, 01.08.2006, *Gazeta*, http://www.gazeta.ru/2006/08/01/oa_210252.shtml
44. Aleksey Terekhov, *Sheykhs feel tired*
45. Aleksey Olshanskiy, Yuriy Kochemin, *Contemporary Slave*, *Noviye Izvestiya*, 21.06.2007
46. Olga Pavlikova, *The country of slaves and masters*, *Gazeta*, no:44, 16.03.2006.
47. <http://www.mvd.rupress/release/4165/4165>
48. Aleksanr Kolesnichenko, Kira Vasilyeva, *Mafia is immortal*, *Noviye Izvestiya*, 14.03.2007
49. <http://kiev-security.org.ua/box/4/98.shtml>
50. Suzanna Farisova, Dmitriy Butrin, *MVD and FMS warn about harm of illegal migration*, *Kommersant*, No:45(3376), 16.03.2006
51. Antonio Maria Costa, *ibidem*.